

Candidate Forename						Candidate Surname					
Centre Number						Candidate Number					

OXFORD CAMBRIDGE AND RSA EXAMINATIONS
ADVANCED SUBSIDIARY GCE
F491
CRITICAL THINKING
UNIT 1 Credibility of Evidence

MONDAY 18 MAY 2009: Afternoon
DURATION: 1 hour 15 minutes

SUITABLE FOR VISUALLY IMPAIRED CANDIDATES

Candidates answer on the question paper.

OCR SUPPLIED MATERIALS:

Resource Booklet F491/RB

OTHER MATERIALS REQUIRED:

None

READ INSTRUCTIONS OVERLEAF

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name clearly in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read each question carefully and make sure that you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer ALL the questions.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided, however additional paper may be used if necessary.
- Additional answer space is available on the lined pages at the back of this book. Answers on these pages must be clearly numbered.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is 80.
- You will be awarded up to 5 marks overall for the quality of your written communication.

BLANK PAGE

Read the documents and then answer the questions that follow.

The 5 documents in the Resource Booklet contain reports relating to the dispute as to whether giving financial rights to couples who have been living together is likely to undermine the institution of marriage.

**SECTION A: ASSESSING THE
CREDIBILITY OF DOCUMENTS**

- 1 There may be weaknesses in the credibility of the reporting of proposed changes to legal rights (other than the financial rights of couples who have been living together).**

Explain THREE possible weaknesses in the credibility of such reporting.

1 _____

_____ **[2]**

2

[2]

3

[2]

- 2** *Fig. 1 in Document 2 shows a change in the percentage of people getting married.*

Suggest TWO possible explanations for this change.

1 _____
_____ [1]

2 _____
_____ [1]

3 Consider the credibility of Document 2 One Plus One and Document 4 ekklesia.co.uk.

For each document make THREE points of assessment, each of which should:

- **identify a relevant credibility criterion**
- **use this to assess the credibility of the document**
- **make reference to the text to support your assessment.**

Document 2

1 _____

_____ **[3]**

2

[3]

3

[3]

Document 4

1 _____

_____ **[3]**

2 _____

_____ **[3]**

3

[3]

Total Marks for Section A [26]

**SECTION B: ASSESSING THE
CREDIBILITY OF EVIDENCE**

- 4 *Consider the bishops' claim in Document 5, "It would inevitably lead to the question, 'Why marry at all?'"***
They seem to assume that the main reason for marriage is for financial benefit.

Suggest TWO ways in which this assumption might be challenged.

1 _____
_____ **[1]**

2 _____
_____ **[1]**

5 Consider the claims made by the Law Commissioner in Document 1 and the Archbishop of Canterbury in Document 3.

Assess the credibility of their claims. For each of these sources make TWO points of assessment, each of which should:

- **identify a claim made (you can use the same claim twice.)**
- **assess how this claim is strengthened or weakened by any relevant credibility criterion**
- **state what you must suppose to be true in order to reach your assessment.**

THE LAW COMMISSIONER

1 _____

_____ [5]

2

[5]

THE ARCHBISHOP OF CANTERBURY

1

[5]

2

[5]

- 6 Use ONE credibility criterion to compare the credibility of the Law Commissioner with that of the Archbishop of Canterbury.**

[2]

Total Marks for Section B [24]

SECTION C: COMING TO A REASONED JUDGEMENT

- 7 Come to a reasoned judgement as to whether or not giving financial rights to unmarried couples who have been living together would undermine the institution of marriage.**

In your answers you should refer to the individual sources WITHIN the documents.

(a) State TWO precise claims that are corroborated.

Support each of these with two references from the text.

1 _____

_____ **[3]**

2 _____

_____ [3]

(b) State TWO precise claims where conflict arises.

Support each of these with two references from the text.

1 _____

_____ **[3]**

2 _____

_____ **[3]**

- (c) Identify ALL the individual sources within the documents on each side of the above dispute.**

Identify any source that does not fit easily onto either side.

[4]

- (d) State which side, if any, has the greater weight of evidence, supporting this with numbers of sources.**

[2]

[6]

- (f) State the judgement that results from your assessment as to whether or not giving financial rights to unmarried couples who have been living together would undermine the institution of marriage.**

[1]

Total Marks for Section C [25]

Five marks are available for the quality of written communication [5]

PAPER TOTAL 80 Marks

[illegible]

[illegible]

[illegible]

Copyright Information

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations, is given to all schools that receive assessment material and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PB.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.