



ADVANCED GCE
CRITICAL THINKING
Unit 3: Resolution of Dilemmas

F493/RB

RESOURCE BOOKLET

Tuesday 9 June 2009
Afternoon

Duration: 1 hour 15 minutes



INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Use Documents 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 to answer the questions.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- This document consists of **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

Document 1**What is the difference between 'positive action' and 'positive discrimination'?**

Positive action is where an employer provides support or encouragement to a particular racial group. It is only allowed where a specific racial group is badly under-represented among those doing particular work or filling particular posts in an employer's workforce.

The employer is allowed to provide special training to members of the racial group. They can also encourage members of the racial group to apply to do the work or fill the posts (for example, by saying that applications from them will be particularly welcome).

This does not mean that employers can discriminate in favour of the members of the group when it comes to choosing people to do the work or fill the posts, that is unlawful discrimination.

Positive action is not the same as 'positive discrimination', which is where members of a particular racial group are treated more favourably. Positive discrimination is unlawful.

Source: <http://www.direct.gov.uk/en/Employment/Employees/DiscriminationAtWork>

Document 2**Police ‘not taking ethnic minority recruitment seriously’****New figures reveal forces struggling to hit targets for non-whites**

Police forces have been accused of ignoring their promise to give jobs to ethnic minorities. The statistics showed one force hired just one non-white police community support officer in four years. While the Scottish arm of the British Transport Police (BTP) has just one Asian officer among its 227-strong ranks.

Figures released by the Home Office earlier this month show Cleveland police recruited just one police community support officer from an ethnic minority between 2002 and 2006 – it has 11 ethnic minority officers from ranks of about 1,700. Over the past 12 months Humberside police has taken on 79 new recruits – only one from an ethnic minority background. While North Wales police has just eight non-white officers from a force of more than 1,634 – less than 0.5 per cent. All three are among scores of forces currently missing their recruitment targets.

A spokesman for the BTP in Scotland said: “In common with all other forces in Scotland, BTP actively encourages applications from those from an ethnic minority background. Staff from BTP in Scotland work hard with the local community and regularly attend recruitment fairs and positive action events to encourage representation from the ethnic minority background.”

Source: <http://www.channel4.com/news>

Document 3**Call for a change in the law**

Trevor Phillips, chair of the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE), has called for a new debate on positive discrimination. Phillips recently said it was “a matter of national security” that the law be changed to enable police and intelligence agencies to recruit more ethnic minorities.

Gloucestershire and Avon and Somerset police forces had to scrap schemes that used positive discrimination earlier this year, after the CRE ruled they breached the Race Relations Act.

Source: <http://www.personneltoday.com/articles>

Document 4**Minority officers 'need positive discrimination'**

Black and Asian police officers should benefit from positive discrimination to get promoted into top jobs, a conference has heard. Keith Jarrett, the president of the National Black Police Association (NBPA), said they should be appointed to senior roles even if they are less qualified than their white counterparts.

At the NBPA's annual conference in Bristol, he said the police should actively promote ethnic minorities to reflect the communities they serve. "People are saying 'I want to see someone who looks like me, who is not the cleaner, who is not sweeping the street or making the tea and coffee'," he said. "The Metropolitan and West Midlands police forces and all these big conurbations could do with someone who looks like the communities – and that's not happening."

Mr Jarrett said two forces had promoted black officers above the rank of Chief Inspector even though they had not gained their Senior Command Course qualification. "The reason for this is that they are the right persons for the job," he said. "Affirmative action is having the right person for the job."

However, the Police Minister said: "I'm not wild about positive action. It's not right that there is only one black chief constable in the country. But I want people to advance on merit through a fair system."

Source: <http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news>

Document 5**Chief constables in England and Wales are to discuss whether to boost the recruitment of black and Asian officers by 'affirmative action'**

The Association of Chief Police Officers (ACPO) will debate the move, which would need employment law changes. However, critics rejected this proposal and suggested that the police should make itself more attractive to ethnic minorities.

Under the changes being considered, black and Asian recruits with the necessary qualifications would be fast-tracked, to meet quotas set by each force. According to ACPO, the plans would represent 'affirmative action', which it defines as the process of prioritising minorities once they have passed initial selection procedures. Under such a plan, if two job candidates met the required standards, the candidate whose ethnicity is under-represented in the force would be selected. ACPO says this differs from 'positive discrimination', which it says means hiring minorities regardless of whether they are qualified for a job.

Nick Johnson, from the Commission for Racial Equality, said there were better ways of addressing the problem of under-representation. He said: "Positive action is about going into certain communities, targeting resources, targeting promotional work, building up training and development – that's something we would support. Picking someone simply because of the colour of their skin for a job is not something we would support."

Source: <http://news.bbc.co.uk>

BLANK PAGE

**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations, is given to all schools that receive assessment material and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1PB.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.