

Cambridge International AS & A Level

HINDUISM

9487/01

Paper 1 Concepts in Hinduism

May/June 2024

MARK SCHEME

Maximum Mark: 60

Published

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and candidates, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which Examiners were instructed to award marks. It does not indicate the details of the discussions that took place at an Examiners' meeting before marking began, which would have considered the acceptability of alternative answers.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the question paper and the Principal Examiner Report for Teachers.

Cambridge International will not enter into discussions about these mark schemes.

Cambridge International is publishing the mark schemes for the May/June 2024 series for most Cambridge IGCSE, Cambridge International A and AS Level and Cambridge Pre-U components, and some Cambridge O Level components.

This document consists of **19** printed pages.

Generic Marking Principles

These general marking principles must be applied by all examiners when marking candidate answers. They should be applied alongside the specific content of the mark scheme or generic level descriptions for a question. Each question paper and mark scheme will also comply with these marking principles.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 1:

Marks must be awarded in line with:

- the specific content of the mark scheme or the generic level descriptors for the question
- the specific skills defined in the mark scheme or in the generic level descriptors for the question
- the standard of response required by a candidate as exemplified by the standardisation scripts.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 2:

Marks awarded are always **whole marks** (not half marks, or other fractions).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 3:

Marks must be awarded **positively**:

- marks are awarded for correct/valid answers, as defined in the mark scheme. However, credit is given for valid answers which go beyond the scope of the syllabus and mark scheme, referring to your Team Leader as appropriate
- marks are awarded when candidates clearly demonstrate what they know and can do
- marks are not deducted for errors
- marks are not deducted for omissions
- answers should only be judged on the quality of spelling, punctuation and grammar when these features are specifically assessed by the question as indicated by the mark scheme. The meaning, however, should be unambiguous.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 4:

Rules must be applied consistently, e.g. in situations where candidates have not followed instructions or in the application of generic level descriptors.

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 5:

Marks should be awarded using the full range of marks defined in the mark scheme for the question (however; the use of the full mark range may be limited according to the quality of the candidate responses seen).

GENERIC MARKING PRINCIPLE 6:

Marks awarded are based solely on the requirements as defined in the mark scheme. Marks should not be awarded with grade thresholds or grade descriptors in mind.

Generic Levels of response descriptions

These level descriptors address Assessment Objectives (AOs) 1 and 2, and should be used in conjunction with the indicative content for each question in the mark scheme.

Assessment Objectives

AO1: Knowledge and understanding

Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of teachings, beliefs and practices, including relevance for individual Hindus and communities.

AO2: Analysis and evaluation

Analyse, evaluate and discuss evidence, points of view and issues in Hinduism.

Generic marking principles

- (a) Examiners should use the performance summary statements at the top of the descriptors to help to identify a level which matches the candidate's response. However, the final decision on the band and the mark within the band should be made on the basis of **all** the descriptors in the level and not primarily using the performance summary statement.
- (b) Examiners should start at the lowest level, if the answer meets all the criteria they should then move to the next level and so on. The Examiner should repeat this process until there is a match between the overall answer and the level descriptor. Examiners should use a best-fit approach when deciding upon the level, it is possible for a different level to be chosen for each AO.
- (c) If the Examiner identifies all aspects of the level descriptor within the answer then the highest mark for the level should be given. Examiners should also make reference to the indicative content when deciding on the mark within a level to ensure that there is sufficient relevant content evident within the answer for the level and mark. Examiners should be prepared to credit material in answers which is not contained in the indicative content.
- (d) The Examiner may need to make a judgement within a level or between two or more level statements. Once a 'best-fit' level statement has been identified, use the following guidance to decide on a specific mark:
 - Where the candidate's work **convincingly** meets the level statement, you should award the highest mark.
 - Where the candidate's work **adequately** meets the level statement, you should award the most appropriate mark in the middle of the range.
 - Where the candidate's work **just** meets the level statement, you should award the lowest mark.

5 mark questions

Level	AO1 Knowledge and understanding	Marks
Level 3	<p>Accurate knowledge with good understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of detailed, accurate and relevant knowledge. • Demonstrates understanding through a well-developed response. • Fully addresses the question. • Good understanding of the wider context, if relevant. 	5
Level 2	<p>Partially accurate knowledge with limited understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of knowledge which may be partially accurate. • Demonstrates limited understanding through a partially developed response. • Addresses some aspects of the question. • Attempts to engage with the wider context, if relevant. 	3–4
Level 1	<p>Basic knowledge and basic understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifies a limited range of knowledge which may not be accurate. • Demonstrates basic understanding through a limited response. • Response is relevant to the topic, but does not directly address the question. • Little or no reference to the wider context, if relevant. 	1–2
Level 0	No relevant material to credit.	0

10 mark questions

Level	AO1 Knowledge and understanding	Marks
Level 4	<p>Accurate knowledge with good understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of detailed, accurate and relevant knowledge. • Demonstrates understanding through a well-developed response. • Fully addresses the question. • Good understanding of the wider context, if relevant. 	9–10
Level 3	<p>Mostly accurate knowledge with some understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of mostly accurate and relevant knowledge. • Demonstrates understanding through a developed response. • Addresses most aspects of the question. • Some engagement with the wider context, if relevant. 	6–8
Level 2	<p>Partially accurate knowledge with limited understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uses a range of knowledge which may be partially accurate. • Demonstrates limited understanding through a partially developed response. • Addresses some aspects of the question. • Attempts to engage with the wider context, if relevant. 	3–5
Level 1	<p>Basic knowledge and basic understanding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identifies a limited range of knowledge which may not be accurate. • Demonstrates basic understanding through a limited response. • Response is relevant to the topic, but does not directly address the question. • Little or no reference to the wider context, if relevant. 	1–2
Level 0	No relevant material to credit.	0

15 mark questions

Level	AO2 Analysis and evaluation	Marks
Level 5	<p>Thorough discussion supported with evidence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analyses the importance and/or strength of different arguments/points of view. Uses accurate evidence to support a well-structured discussion. Coherent conclusion to the question which evaluates knowledge and points of view and assesses alternative conclusions. 	13–15
Level 4	<p>Coherent discussion supported with evidence</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Discusses different arguments/points of view in some detail. Uses accurate evidence to support a structured discussion. Coherent conclusion to the question which evaluates knowledge and points of view. 	10–12
Level 3	<p>Clear discussion with some support</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recognises different arguments/points of view and discusses at least one in some detail. Uses some evidence to support discussion. Clear conclusion to the question which is linked to a range of knowledge and points of view. 	7–9
Level 2	<p>Attempts a discussion with limited support</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Outlines one or more argument/point of view. Uses supporting evidence for one or more relevant point. The support may not be wholly relevant or accurate. Attempts a conclusion to the question which is linked to knowledge and/or a point of view. 	4–6
Level 1	<p>Basic response with a point of view</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> States a point of view. Little or no supporting evidence. May attempt a basic conclusion, which may not directly address the question. 	1–3
Level 0	No relevant material to credit.	0

Question	Answer	Marks
1(a)	<p>Summarise what the above passage says about sthri dharma.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Responses will be marked according to the 5 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>The duty of women is defined in terms of her marriage and her interactions with her husband. Her primary responsibility is to be his companion and to serve him as devotedly as she would serve a god. She should show this level of devotion even if he is unable or unwilling to care for her in return and, after his death, she should remain so devoted, meditating upon him for the rest of her life. She should accept however he treats her and any personal defects she sees him to have without complaining to him. She is also responsible for the management of their shared home and for the children – part of her dharma is to have children and part of it is to bring them up to be good people.</p> <p>Purity, virtue, beauty, grace and a desire to serve are the qualities an ideal woman should display, as these are the qualities which will please and best serve her husband.</p>	5

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	<p>Explain the relationship of dharma to moral behaviour.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 10 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Many of the possible ways of understanding dharma – duty, order, religion, law, righteousness – suggest a strong link with morality. It would be overly simplistic to say that dharma is a synonym for morality, but moral choices and right actions are certainly a part of dharma and dharmic behaviour and in this context, dharma might be most commonly understood as duty or righteousness. Dharma can be seen as the foundation of Hindu ethics, since it deals with things being in their proper place, fulfilling their proper roles; it creates and maintains order and harmony and the absence of dharma leaves space for the opposite.</p> <p>Dharma is therefore an important factor in how people live. But, since dharma can be understood as both cosmic and personal in scope, it's specific relationship to moral behaviour is complex and there are different kinds of dharma which need to be considered. Sadharana dharma is a term which denotes the existence of universal ethical principles; different lists of what these principles might be exist, but most include ahimsa (harmlessness), satya (truth) and asteya (not stealing) as well as generosity and some specific forms of self-control. These are not abstract principles to be reflected upon but actions that guide moral behaviour and, if followed, contribute to a dharmic lifestyle.</p> <p>Dharma also exists in relation to varna and the social obligations each varna has; these moral principles are not universal because the responsibilities of the varnas are different. The Bhagavad Gita is perhaps the best-known illustration of the principle that what is a moral choice for a person within one varna might not be so for a person in another, as Arjuna is told his duty as a warrior involves killing others in a righteous cause. The Gita also teaches that it is better to follow one's own dharma badly than another person's well and this applies even where these actions seem contradictory. The guidance given in the Gita promotes dharmic action as the best path.</p> <p>Other specific dharma arises in relation to ashrama, gender and personal circumstances. This leads to the concept of svadharma, personal dharma, which is the dharma of each individual. Choosing a moral course of action might well highlight conflicts between svadharma and other dharmas, meaning it is not always a simple choice between a dharmic and an adharmic action. For example, Rama's duties as a king conflicted with his duties as a husband when Sita's purity was questioned. Pursuing dharma is one of the purusharthas (aims of life), informing how the others are fulfilled, it is therefore a core aspect of moral behaviour and living a fundamentally dharmic life.</p>	10

Question	Answer	Marks
1(b)	Varna dharma and ashrama dharma are traditionally associated only with men; women have their own sthri dharma. The duties of sthri dharma are specific to women and the actions considered the responsibility of women, but the association between fulfilling dharma and being a moral or virtuous person is more generally applicable. The diverse understandings of dharma, and the many sources that offer guidance on it, illustrate the central importance of the concept in Hindu life. The connection with moral behaviour is important in many of these sources because in dharmic religion action is emphasised over belief/faith.	

Question	Answer	Marks
1(c)	<p>‘Knowing about varnashramadharma tells Hindus everything they need to know about their svadharma.’ Discuss.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and Evaluation. Response will be marked according to the 15 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Varnashramadharma is a compound word, bringing together the concepts of varna, ashrama and dharma. It describes the idea of dharma arising from an individual’s varna and ashrama, which implies that if a person is aware of both of these things, then they should also be aware of their various duties and responsibilities to both their family and to wider society. It can be argued that this is intended to be a complete summary of personal dharma, with the Dharmashastras (and particularly the Manusmriti) going into great detail about the duties of each section of society.</p> <p>Varnashramadharma is sometimes used as a synonym for svadharma, supporting the view that knowing varnashramadharma is a complete summary. Dharma is a central concept in Hinduism, and it can be understood in many different ways, but the emphasis of the term when it is associated with varna and ashrama is on action and it could therefore be argued that as long as actions are appropriate, knowledge – including knowledge of the things that make the action appropriate, is of less concern.</p> <p>It can be argued that the emphasis of varnashramadharma is on dharma in relation to others while svadharma is focused on the individual. Varna is concerned with social class and what each group has to do in order for society to function. Ashrama, which is usually connected to the individual’s own age, is concerned with responsibilities to, and relationship with one’s family. It is, however, possible to become a sannyasin at any age and without passing through the other ashramas to do so; this implies that svadharma can be different from the socially prescribed dharma of a passage through the ashramas. As set out in the Manusmriti, passage through all the ashramas is not required of all Hindus, but only the higher varnas. It might still be regarded as an aspirational ideal however, or indeed separated from the varna system by those who wish to practise it in a contemporary world which embraces equity in all things.</p> <p>As an ideal, the concept of varnashramadharma presumes harmony between the requirements of varna and ashrama but there is the possibility of clashes between the dharma of each for an individual. The story of Rama gives an example of this when his duty to his people as a king requires him to treat Sita as under suspicion, while his duty as a husband (who knows her to be innocent) requires him to support her. While most people are not kings it is not hard to imagine situations in the contemporary world where work responsibilities and expectations interfere with the needs of family. It is also true that few societies today are structured according to the varna system. Therefore, knowing one’s varna, and even knowing the dharma of it, is not necessarily helpful in deciding how to live a dharmic life in a situation that is wholly outside that structure.</p>	15

Question	Answer	Marks
1(c)	<p>Similarly, women have been considered by some as having their own dharma, regardless of their varna and ashrama. For Hindus holding this view it would be more important for a woman's svadharma to support her husband in following his varnashramadharmas than to be concerned with her own.</p> <p>Since dharma is understood in such diverse ways a universally shared understanding of either varnashramadharmas or svadharma is unlikely to exist. An individual Hindu's understanding of either or both concepts is likely to be affected by how they have learned about their own dharmic responsibilities. Textual sources often dominate academic understandings, but might be less significant for practitioners, who are also informed by custom and tradition.</p>	

Question	Answer	Marks
2(a)	<p>Outline the qualities of a dharmic society.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 5 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>In the broadest sense a dharmic society would be one that is built on dharmic principles, upholding and promoting them through social structures and values. The concept of dharma encompasses law, order and religion; the root of the word is a term meaning to uphold or support so a dharmic society is one that supports things like law, order, religious practice and ethical behaviour.</p> <p>More specifically an ideal dharmic society might be understood as one organised according to the principles of varna and ashrama. The varnas, or social classes, meaning that the necessary work of a society is done by the people best suited to it, while the ashramas inform the economic and religious involvement of people in that society. This organisation, as an ideal, implies an orderly society in which everyone knows their place and their role and is valued accordingly.</p>	5

Question	Answer	Marks
2(b)	<p>Explain the relationship between dharma and the cycle of the four ages (Mahayuga).</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 10 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>A Mahayuga (great age) is a name for a single epoch of time in Hindu cosmology, that is once through a 4 320 0000 year cycle of four yugas. At the end of the fourth yuga there is a total destruction and recreation of all things so that the cycle can begin again. The balance between dharma – order, harmony, righteousness – and adharma can be understood as the thing driving this cycle. This cosmology has developed over a period of time rather than being contained in its entirety in a single source and therefore different understandings are possible.</p> <p>Destruction and recreation is necessary because time is not only cyclical but also degenerative – things degrade rather than improve as time passes. This is analogous to an aging body which cannot grow younger but it extends beyond the physical to include morality and spirituality as well. Religion and virtue are possible in any age – dharma never vanishes entirely – but how much effort is required to maintain a righteous life increases, the desire for it decreases and it becomes harder to know what such a life would look like.</p> <p>The cycle begins with dharma being all pervading and ends with a state of adharma. This process is marked by the characteristics of the four yugas. The first, the Satya Yuga is the age of truth, a golden age when all humans are inherently good. The balance of dharma and adharma shifts gradually towards adharma through the Treta and Dvapara Yugas until, by the Kali Yuga, there is more adharma than dharma. It is at this point that Shiva destroys the world, to remove the adharma from the raw material and allow a new, pure Satya Yuga. Prakriti (matter) consists of three gunas, and each age is characterised by a predominance of one – for example, the Satya Yuga is characterised by sattva guna (purity, truth). Destructions rebalances these gunas prior to the new creation. The Epics are said to have been written in different Yugas, to reflect the decline of dharma and the changes in the world that result from it. The role of the deities, and particularly Vishnu through his avatars, in upholding dharma becomes increasingly important as the Yugas progress.</p> <p>Throughout the ages both knowledge of dharma and the inherent orientation of human beings towards it are believed to grow less. The metaphor of a cow or bull is sometimes used to illustrate the presence of dharma in the world, standing firmly on four legs in the Satya Yuga but balancing precariously on only one by the Kali Yuga.</p>	10

Question	Answer	Marks
2(c)	<p>Assess the claim that ‘varna’ and ‘caste’ mean the same thing.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and Evaluation. Response will be marked according to the 15 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Indian society as observed during British rule is commonly presented as the clearest representation of a caste system in modern history. Such observations also often uncritically conflate the sociological idea of caste with the Hindu concept of varna, to the point that the two terms might be considered interchangeable. While it would be hard to argue there is no overlap at all, varna does after all divide society into groups, whether the two terms are synonyms is less clear and, even if they are in contemporary usage, historically this has not been the case. The Rig Veda, the oldest Hindu text, can be used to support an essential distinction.</p> <p>‘Caste’ is a sociological term used to describe the divisions or sections of a rigidly structured society, with each identified section being one caste. Castes are usually structured around a single thing, which might be wealth, profession, inherited names or titles or ethnicity. A society that structures itself around this kind of division can be described as a caste system.</p> <p>Caste systems are usually hierarchical, with some castes having higher status than others. An individual person’s caste is usually determined by the caste of the family they are born into, and it cannot subsequently be changed. Level of education, access to social institutions, form of employment, marriage and other social interactions might all be determined by caste and a strict enforcing of such distinctions is usually an element of a caste system.</p> <p>Varna literally means ‘colour’ and it is sometimes translated as ‘caste’. However, much contemporary scholarship suggests it is better translated as ‘class’, also a sociological term but one with very different implications. For example, caste is determined by a single factor while class is usually determined by a variety and where caste is inherited and unchangeable class is usually considered more flexible. Those who choose class as their preferred translation might argue that varna is a means of organising people according to their occupation but that there is no reason or expectation that occupation is determined by birth. A well-known passage in the Rig Veda (the same text which gives an account of the origin of the varnas) clearly indicates the opposite: “I am a singer; my father is a doctor and my mother is grinder of corn”.</p> <p>It can also be argued that in practice, at least in recent history, the caste system creates an avarna group, wholly outside the scope of the varna system. It is this fact, and the social discrimination and oppression associated with it, that leads many Hindus to reject the idea that varna and caste are the same. The Rig Veda identifies four varnas – brahmins (priests), kshatriyas (warriors), vaishyas (business people) and shudras (servants). No mention is made of a fifth group or of anyone not having a place in the system at all, neither is the system presented as essentially hierarchical. Caste is therefore often considered a corruption of varna.</p>	15

Question	Answer	Marks
2(c)	<p>This is complicated however by the connection between the idea of outcaste groups and ideas of ritual purity and pollution; for example, people whose work puts them into contact with death are ritually impure and therefore outcaste. Simply arguing that the concept of avarna is not supported by a proper understanding of the system does not remove this problem – the work must be done, the people who do it are spiritually polluted by it and that impurity cannot be cleansed. In short, separating the religious and cultural aspects of the system in practice requires engaging with and perhaps dismantling more than just the idea of varna.</p> <p>It is certainly clear that both terms deal with social structures and organisation, but which is best applied to a given real-world example varies with the interpretations and understanding of the observer. It seems likely that many people would not see any significant difference between them in terms of the practical, lived realities within a society although, differences certainly exist from an academic perspective. Whether the distinction is important depends on questions of status and, in the contemporary world, issues of equality arising from that. It might also have significance in relation to consideration of existential questions around karma and rebirth.</p>	

Question	Answer	Marks
3(a)	<p>Summarise what the above passage says about how people remain trapped in samsara.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 5 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Being trapped in samsara (bondage) is caused by attachment to senses and things in the material world. Attachment is a mental process, which is manifest in both the desire to have something and grief at losing it. Other mental attitudes also maintain this bondage because they indicate an attachment to things that are not real – acceptance and rejection and feeling either positive or negative emotions in response to stimuli are examples of this. Liberation is achieved via equanimity, being detached from such things. Relying on the body’s senses to understand things is also attachment and liberation cannot take place while that is happening. When the mind is able to let go of all of these attachments it is also able to let go of the idea that there is a real ‘I’; belief in a real ‘I’ is another barrier to liberation.</p>	5

Question	Answer	Marks
3(b)	<p>Explain why sakama karma is not a path to moksha.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 10 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Sakama karma is one of two types of karma used to explain the karma marga, which is one of the paths to moksha. It means selfish action, or action motivated by desire, the opposite of niskama karma (selfless or desireless action). Moksha is liberation, freedom from the cycle of death and rebirth. The ways this cycle can be ended are informed by what is believed to be holding the self (atman) in bondage in the first place; according to the karma marga it is attachment to desire. Creating karma through one’s actions is a barrier to moksha: sakama karma creates new karma while nishkama karma does not.</p> <p>Sakama karma does not describe selfish actions in the usual sense the English language ascribes to that term; it is not about acting in one’s own self-interest in the current moment of the current lifetime, seeking personal gain or pleasure in this life and disregarding (or actively compromising) the needs of other people. This kind of selfishness would result in negative karma and thus prevent the atman from becoming liberated. Sakama karma is a description for a selfishness of a different kind, a concern with the atman rather than the physical self of the current birth. Actions and choices that are made on a consideration of their karmic consequences, and the potential reward for making a good or virtuous choice, might well involve the consideration of, and positive outcomes for other people.</p> <p>However, they are motivated by the desire for positive karma rather than by the detached knowledge of what the right thing is.</p> <p>Desiring that positive karma – the fruits of the action – signals an attachment to samsara, this results in further entangling the atman within it. Karma is still created by the action and must be played out in future rebirths. Those rebirths may be easy or pleasant because the karma is positive but they are still rebirths into samsara. Moksha can only be achieved via actions which no longer create any karma, which means acting without the desire for the fruits of those actions.</p>	10

Question	Answer	Marks
3(c)	<p>‘To achieve moksha a Hindu must surrender fully to God, like a kitten being carried by its mother.’ Discuss.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and Evaluation. Response will be marked according to the 15 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>A kitten being carried by its mother (also known as the cat analogy) is one way in which philosophers describe the relationship between God and a worshipper. The kitten dangles from the mother cat’s mouth, with no effort required on its part. What’s more if it did try to do anything it would actually interfere with its mother’s efforts and make it harder for her to take it where she needs to go. This is a metaphor for God as personal, connected with devotees and actively carrying them towards liberation. All the devotee has to do is trust that God will get them there. This could be argued as a description of the bhakti marga, where a devotee focuses their life and being entirely on their ishvara in the belief that they will attain liberation through the grace of that deity.</p> <p>Conceptually, bhakti can be understood as an act of surrender (prapatti), in which the devotee gives themselves completely to the deity, letting go of the ego and trusting in their grace. This is also known as ‘taking refuge’ in one’s ishvara. Through surrender the need human beings have for God is made manifest; humanity is dependent upon God and therefore needs to show devotion. In this worldview moksha is being close to God or eternally in the presence of ishvara. However, other perspectives have different understandings about the nature of moksha and surrender would not be a path to attain it.</p> <p>Bhakti is not the only path to liberation recognised by Hinduism and the cat analogy is not a good description for other paths. Both the karma and jnana marga require effort on the part of the worshipper. A monkey mother, whose baby has to cling on without assistance from her, is often used as the contrasting analogy to the cat. For people following these paths a sense of the presence of God might be an inspiration or source of strength but it is the worshipper’s own efforts that result in liberation. If God is more like the monkey, then surrendering and waiting to be carried won’t get the worshipper anywhere.</p> <p>Presenting these two analogies also implies that there is an either-or choice – God is either like the cat or like the monkey, the belief of the individual determines their path and, perhaps, there is a right choice and a wrong one. None of these implications are necessarily true of Hinduism. It could be argued that Hinduism recognises such a great diversity of practices so that the individual can find God in the way, and through the means, which are best for them. It is not a matter of what one must do but rather of what is the best fit for them in their current circumstances.</p> <p>It might also be argued that cat analogy is poor one even for bhakti, since the total devotion required is very far from effortless. The ultimate goal of liberation is not accessible without grace, but pleasing the deity who will grant that grace requires more than simply lying back and waiting for it to arrive. It is important to be aware that achieving moksha is not wholly within human control – no specific set of actions guarantees this result.</p>	15

Question	Answer	Marks
4(a)	<p>Outline the difference between vikarma and akarma.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 5 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Vikarma and akarma are both terms used to clarify or qualify specific examples that fall within the broader category of action – karma. In other words, they describe different types of action. The terms can be translated as ‘no action’ (akarma) and ‘wrong action’ (vikarma) but akarma does not actually describe doing nothing at all. Both involve taking actions but vikarma are actions which keep the atman bound in samsara and akarma are actions that move it closer to liberation because they don’t create karma.</p>	5

Question	Answer	Marks
4(b)	<p>Contrast the different expectations of the jnana marga and karma marga for an individual seeking liberation.</p> <p>AO1 – Knowledge and Understanding. Response will be marked according to the 10 mark level descriptors (AO1).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>The expectations for an individual following a particular marga are most likely to be in the impact that the practices required by that marga will have on how they live their life. Neither the karma marga nor the jnana marga require renunciation or extremes of austerity but they are not simply concerned with occasional acts of worship either. Marga means path or way to liberation, and as such they should be understood as a lifelong process to which the individual must be committed. The margas are also sometimes referred to as yogas, which in this context can be understood as spiritual discipline; this carries the same expectations of commitment and intention to the chosen path, along with an expectation that one will follow the path through all of its stages until moksha is attained.</p> <p>The jnana marga is the way of knowledge. It is strongly associated with Advaita Vedanta, with liberation being attained by achieving an understanding of the self as non-different from Brahman; this is not the only form it can take although it does generally involve becoming detached from the ego. Following the jnana marga involves contemplation and reflection on the nature of the self and reality, which is usually undertaken under the guidance and supervision of a guru. It also involves the study of Hindu scriptures, which might require learning to read different languages and alphabets. Traditionally people on the jnana marga were encouraged to think and speak of themselves in the third person, to emphasise that they were trying to free themselves from ego. Jnana marga involves the possibility of becoming jivan mukti, because the necessary realisation of ultimate reality can take place at any point in a person's life.</p> <p>Karma marga is the way of action, with the emphasis being on selfless or desireless action (nishkama karma) that will not create new karma and so, ultimately, frees the atman. Individuals on the karma marga should act in accordance with dharma, motivated only by that and not by any consideration of the potential results or fruits of their actions. It is less associated with the need for a guru than the jnana marga, although help might sometimes be required to determine what the dharmic action is in complex situations. Although it does not emphasise detachment from self and ego in the way jnana marga does it is not concerned with preserving an attachment to the self but rather with looking beyond it. Sewa (selfless service) might also be emphasised in the karma marga.</p> <p>Both jnana and bhakti marga are described in the Bhagavad Gita and they are therefore two of what some scholars have called the Trimarga, three paths to liberation that are rooted in the Vedas. As such one cannot be considered better or more admirable than the other, they are simply different paths suited to different people striving for the same goal.</p>	10

Question	Answer	Marks
4(c)	<p>Assess the claim that there is no way to know if a person is jivan mukti.</p> <p>AO2 – Analysis and Evaluation. Response will be marked according to the 15 mark level descriptors (AO2).</p> <p>Candidates might refer to some of the following:</p> <p>Jivan mukti is the state of being liberated while still living within samsara; the person will live the rest of their current life but will not be reborn. Some schools of Hinduism do not recognise a possibility of liberation prior to physical death and those holding this view would regard the issue as irrelevant or the result of a delusion. However, many Hindu thinkers, such as Shankara, Ramanuja and Mahavira are widely considered to have been jivan mukti and this could be used to argue that there must be a way to know whether someone has attained this state. Whether it is important for there to be a way to know might also be open to debate but knowing that the state exists indicates that liberation is an achievable goal during one's lifetime.</p> <p>A person who is jivan mukti has understood the nature of their true self and its relationship to Brahman. They might therefore also be described as self-realised. Many jivanmukta share their experience and insights, acting as a guru for others on the same path. Some gurus have followers worldwide, suggesting that they have qualities which others inherently recognise as valuable. A guru must be knowledgeable, and the appearance of unlimited knowledge is a quality often ascribed to jivan mukti. However, not everyone reacts in the same way to a guru, and this could be used to argue that it is a matter of the belief of the student that their guru is jivan mukti, rather than any objective or externally visible quality in the guru themselves. The state of jivan mukti is such that a person might be unlikely to claim it overtly for themselves – it doesn't ultimately matter whether they are recognised as such or not – and inferences might therefore be drawn from what a potential jivan mukti does or does not say. This might be sufficient for a person seeking initiation with a guru to accept or reject it from a specific individual, but it does not amount to a proof that would be generally accepted.</p> <p>There are other attributes strongly associated with jivan mukti, for example they do not carry out any corrupt or immoral activities, they are indifferent to comfort and discomfort and to their material needs. According to the Upanishads they are also free of any religious obligations. While it could be argued that these offer signs by which a jivan mukti might be recognised it could also be argued that these are things very much in the eye of the beholder. Similarly, the rejection of religious obligations is not in itself proof of anything beyond the choice of that individual not to perform them. It can therefore be argued that only another jivan mukti, who knows the ultimate truth, can say for certain whether a person is jivan mukti or not. However, sometimes titles such as Swami or Sri are given by followers to their guru as an indicator that they are believed to have this special spiritual status.</p> <p>Hinduism recognises different ways in which people can live holy lives or be regarded as spiritual beings and jivan mukti is only one of them. This might mean it is not considered important whether or not a person can be clearly identified a jivan mukti.</p>	15